International Journal of Advance Research in Science and Engineering Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017 www.ijarse.com

COMPARE PARAMETERS OF RCC AND PRESTRESSED STRUCTURES

Prasad Bhamare¹, Sagar Bhosale², Akshay Ghanwat³, Shubham Gore⁴, Sheetal Jadhv⁵, Sachin Patil⁶

^{1,2,3,4,56,}Student, Department of Civil Engineering, Genba Sopanrao Moze College of Engg., Savitribai Phule University,Pune, Maharashtra (India)

ABSTRACT

Precast concrete is well known technology in which some standardized units which are manufactured in factories are used for fast construction. Though the technology is developed many years ago but the implementation is not up the mark in our country. In this study we have carried out detailed study of various concepts of precast, go through number of literature & found the facts associated with it. We have taken one building as a case & Design the same building as a precast building & Traditional Cast in-situ building. Here we have made cost analysis as well as feasibility check on basis of costing & Duration. For more practical study we will visit the two ongoing construction sites of Precast & cast in-situ & gathered required information, From this information analysis It is remarkably seen that the cost of precast building is significantly reduces & duration technology is developed many years ago but the implementation is not up the mark in our country. In this study we have carried out detailed study of various concepts of precast, go through number of literature & found the facts associated with it. From all this study we can be conclude that the precast concrete system is economical than conventional cast in place method but still there are some conditions which we have to take care of while using precast, those are quantity of construction, Distance of site from manufacturing unit, Type of building **etc.**

I. INTRODUCTION

Earlier Roman builders use concrete for construction of culverts, tunnels etc. Now a day's pre-cast technology include a variety of architectural and structural applications which can be used in various element of building. The process was invented by city engineer John Alexander Brodie, Actually idea was not taken up broadly in Britain Yet, it was adopted all over the world, The Precast Concrete industry focuses on utility, underground, and other non-pre-stressed products, and is represented primarily by the National Precast Concrete Association. In this study we have gone through precast structural concepts, structure suitability, feasibility, & cost & time analysis of precast structure. We have also made comparison of both precast & Traditional cast in situ construction method on the basis of selected case. The detailed design of precast & RCC building is prepared & costing of both is compared.

In India RCC Structures are commonly used for Residential as well as commercial Buildings. Post-tensioned Pre-stressed beams are rarely used for the same Buildings, or we can say for short Span Buildings. Two Decade ago there was a big problem of Skilled Workers for Pre-Stressing work. But now there are so many agencies for

Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017

www.ijarse.com



execution of the same work. In RCC Beams, depth of beam increases with increase in Span, because of deflection limitation. Depth of beam can be reduced in Pre-stressed section, for longer span pre-stressed beams are cheaper. This work is proceeding because I want to know the percentage cost difference between both techniques with respect to span.

II. METHODOLOGY

Literature review:- To study the construction techniques of precast and traditional method we have gone through various research papers, books,

Case study & Visits:-In the reference of our work we have visited two constructions sites & Study the similar cases. One is of precast construction & Second was for RCC Structure the actual implementation of precast work is been observed & site difficulties were discussed with engineers & Project manager.

Analysis :- In this work we have made cost comparison as well as feasibility check for precast construction on large scale. Also few advantages & Drawbacks are identified by us.

Design :- In this study we have made RCC Design of a G+12 storied building, sincere attempt is made here to follow the standards. Also for comparison we have made the typical Prestressed design of the same building & compare it with RCC one.

Cost comparison :- After design calculations we have find out the cost of both the structures (i.e RCC & Precast) & made comparison of both. For calculation the market rates are considered. From above Process we have come to the conclusion about the precast construction & related facts about execution & economic aspects. & detail conclusions have been drawn in the report.

Cross Section Comparison :- After design we compare the cross section of both members. Slab and beam of RCC and prestressed building are compared.

Steel Quantity :- Steel required for RCC and prestreesed building is calculated from the given design of building.

Concrete Quantity :- From design, concrete required for RCC and prestressed is calculated. Concrete is mixture of fine aggregate, coarse aggregate, water and cement. For Prestressed structure high strength of cement is used.

Scope

This work includes the design and estimate for Flat Slabs and bem, by R.C.C. and Prestressed Concrete techniques. For smaller spans, associated with normal building works, prestressed concrete construction becomes too cumbersome, irrespective of the economics involved. Intensity of assumed loading is kept sufficient enough, so that the factored bending moment will be comparable to that developing in cases of commercial buildings.

Design information

a. Codes of Practice BS 6399 :Design Loading for Building CP 65 : The Structural Use of Concrete CP3, Chapter V :Wind Load b. Materials Concrete : M30 for topping, walls and all other in-situ works : M40 for precast beam : M40 for precast columns and hollow core slabs Steel : fy = 250 N/mm2 mild steel reinforcement : fy = 460 N/mm2 high yield steel reinforcement : fy = 485 N/mm2 for steel fabric

Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017

www.ijarse.com



reinforcement c. Dead loads Concrete density = 24 kN/m3 Partitions, finishes and services = 1.75 kN/m2Brick walls = 3.0 k/Nm2 in elevation.

b. RCC Design for same building: We Have Also made RCC Design for the same structure. The Details of RCC Design are as follows. The following image shows typical slab portion for the selected case of building.



Figure 01 Showing Slab units considered for Design

Structural System: The building is consideed partialy as cast insitu cosstruction for tasking advantage of regularness in building grids. Beside acting as load bearing walls. staircase wells and lift cores also function as stabilising cores for the superstructure. The precast components consist of hollow core slabs, beams. columns and staircase flights.

a. Hollow core slabs The design of hollow core slabs is based on class 2 prestressed concrete structures with least 2 hours fire retention. The hollow core slabs are 215mm thick & cast with concrete. Each unit is designed as simply supported with minimal 100 mm seating at the support.

b. Precast beams: Precast beams are used in the office area are 540mm deep. The beams, which are un-propped during construction, are seated directly on column corbels and they are designed as simply supported structures. ForLimiting the cracking of the topping concrete at the supports, site placed reinforcement is provided.

Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017 www.ijarse.com g IJARSE ISSN (0) 2319 - 8354 ISSN (P) 2319 - 8346

Name	ľ	No's	Size	•	Reinfo	orce	Reinforce	e	Remark
					ment		ment		
IS1	2	20X12=2	d= 9)"	12#@		12#@		TWO
	4	40			5.5"cc		5.5"cc		WAY
									SLAB
IB1		26x12=31	2	20" X	27"	BO	TTOM:-]	ГОР:- 2 # 20
						2 #	32-	Ι	DE:- 1# 32
						FUI	LL 2 #	(CE:- 3 # 32
						32-			
						CUI	RTAIL		
IB2		26x12=31	2	20" X 30"		BOTTOM:-]	ГОР:- 2 # 20
						3 #	32-	Ι	DE:- 1# 32
						FUI	LL 2 #	(CE:- 4 # 32
						32-			
						CUI	RTAIL		
Column		33		750 X	500	00 12 # 40		1	FIES:- 10 #
								(@ 8"C/C
FOOTIN	3	3	755	0 X	32 #		32 #		A + B -
G			755	0 X	100mm	n	100mm		1300 A -
			130	0	c/c		c/c		650 B-
			150	0	0,0		0,0		650
									030

RCC Design Summary: Table No 01: Showing RCC Design Summaries

IV. COST COMPARISON & TIME EFFECTIVENESS

General comparison

Table 02: Comparison of precase	t &	Cast in s	itu
---------------------------------	-----	-----------	-----

Particular	Precast	RCC
Construction speed	Very rapid speed of	Comparatively slow construction On site
	erection. Rapid	casting, so reinforcement laying & fixing,
	construction on site.	formwork, setting of concrete required
		time.
Quality control	Good quality control.	Quality may affect due to site conditions,
		due to bad supervision, unskilled labor.
Environmental conditions	Weather is eliminated as	Environmental conditions like
	a factor-you can cast in	temperature, humidity can affect on
	any weather and get the	performance of concrete.
	same results, which	
	allows you to perfect	
	mixes and methods	
Labor Requirement	Less labor is required	More Labors required on site in case of
	and that labor can be	RCC.
	less skilled	
Manufacturing conditions	High quality can be	RCC is to casted on site & the site
	achieved because of the	conditions are not regularized, so it may
	controlled conditions in	affect on strength.
	the factory.	

Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017

www.ijarse.com



Quantity discount	Since a Precasters can	The owner can only buy small required
	buy materials for	quantity so quantity discount is not that
	multiple projects,	much.
	quantity discounts can	
	lower costs	
Durability	With the ability to so	RCC is sufficiently durable but it required
	tightly control the	proper quality control.
	process, from materials	
	to consolidation to	
	curing, you can get	
	extremely durable	
	concrete	
Size & Shape	Repeatability-it's easy to	In-situ concreting is suitable where the
	make many copies of the	building is in uneven shape & there are
	same precast product;	no repetitive shapes, Can be possible to
	by maximizing	modify shape on site More flexibility in
	repetition, you can get	execution.
	plenty of value from a	
	mold and a set-up This	
	cannot be modified on	
	site .	
Connections	Connections are simpler	Connections may be difficult
Design Flexibility	building design	Somewhat limited building design
	flexibility is more	flexibility
Size Limitation	No limitation for size.	Because panel size is limited, precast
		concrete cannot be used for two-way
		structural systems.
Cost	It is comparatively	Economics of scale demand regularly
	economical when the	shaped buildings.
	building having no	
	regular shapes.	
Shape	Here we Need Regular	It can be casted in any shape on site.
	shapes in building to	
	achieve economy, Need	
	for repetition of forms	
	will affect building	
	design	

Cost & Duration Comparison: As the population continuously growing rapidly, so the need of rapid or fast construction is requirement of future generation. Precast concrete construction methods are become feasible and alternatives method or solution in such applications Ides buildings and bridges. The primary benefit of precast construction is reduction in time of construction. Waste management and cost efficient construction. Precast concrete is the ideal solution for residential because the structure of residential buildings are somewhat standard so the construction of same type of elements are easy and result in to cost saving on if its production is in bulk.

International Journal of Advance Research in Science and Engineering Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017 ISSN (O) 2319 - 8354

www.ijarse.com

Precast concrete provides stability, Flexibility, sound durable and adaptability with cost efficiency. Precast concrete construction required less construction process which saws money on financing costs. Cost minimization on labor policies, skills, development of employ, providing training to them is main factors. Repairs cost also reduces in precast concrete construction. The following table shows the comparison of precast & cast in situ on basis of duration.

Operation	Precast		Cast-in-place
Number of Day		Number	of Day
Excavation,	Same		Same
Filling, etc.			
Pouring &	1		2
Curing concrete			
Strip Base			
Pour. Cure. Strip	NA		2
Wall			
Pour. Cure. Strip	NA		2
Тор			
Damp proof	NA		1
course			
	1		Included
\Box Install on site			
	2		7
🗆 Total			
Duration in			
Days			

Table 03 Shows Comparison of precast & Cast In-situ on basis of Duration.

Recent works on the concept of precast construction includes those buildings where the majority of structural components are standardized i.e. having same & repetitive size shape and produced in factory in a location away from the construction site. Normally these members are manufactured on bulk production in industries to provide easy construction with less cost & time. When we wisely use precast elements in building systems are seems to be economical when it compared with Conventional type construction of buildings.

IJARSE

ISSN (P) 2319 - 8346

Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017



www.ijarse.com

Perticular	Precast Costing	Perticular	Cast Insitu cost
Excavation for foundation in soft murrum	582912	Excavation for foundation in soft murrum	582912
Excavation for foundation in Hard murrum	1689600	Excavation for foundation in Hard murrum	1689600
Providing & Laying Plain cement concrete for Footting as a PCC bed	1607232	Providing & Laying Plain cement concrete for Footting as a PCC bed	1607232
Providing & laying M-40 RCC for fotting & foundation	8728693.1	Providing & laying M-40 RCC for fotting & foundation	8728693.07
RCC PRECAST Column : Providing and laying RCC precast column of required size with 1:1.5:3 nominal mix using 20mm and down size crushed stone aggregates including shuttering, mixing, compacting, pond curing for 14 days etc. transporting from the place of casting. (Size 700 X 500)	2245320	Providing and casting in situ cement concrete M-40 of trap/granite /quartite/gneiss metal for R.C.C. columns as per detailed designs and drawing or as directed including centering, formwork, cover blocks compacting and roughening the surface if special finishis to be provided and curing complete. (Excluding reinforcement). With fully automatic micro processor based PLC with SCADA enabled reversible drum type concrete mixer With Crushed sand (Size 750 X 500)	2405700
RCC PRECAST BEAM :(For Even area) Providing and laying RCC precast Beams of required size with 1:1.5:3 nominal mix using 20mm and down size crushed stone aggregates including shuttering, mixing, compacting, pond curing for 14 days etc. transporting from the place of casting.(size 535 x 800)	5015604	Providing & casting in situ cement concrete M-20 of trap/granite /quartzite/gneiss metal for R.C.C. beams and lintels as per detailed designs & drawings or as directed including centering, formwork, cover blocks compaction & roughering the surface if special firish is to be provided & curing complete. (Excluding reinforcement). Withfully automatic micro processor based PLC with SCADA enabled reversible drum type concrete mixer With natural sand (For une ven area)	9238986
RCC PRECAST SLAB :(For even area) Providing and laying RCC precast slabs of required size with 1:1.5:3 nominal mix using 20mm and down size crushed stone aggregates including shuttering, mixing, compacting, pond curing for 14 days etc. as per IS 456, transporting from the place of casting. Reinforcent steel shall be paid separately.	15493968	Providing and casting in situ cement concrete M-20 of trap/granite / quartzite/gneiss metal for R.C.C. slabs and landings canopy, wai st slab with steps as per detailed designs and drawings including centering, formwork, cover blocks compacting and roughening the surface if special finish is to be provided and curing complete. (Excluding reinforcement). With fully automatic micro processor based PLC with SCADA enable dreversible drum type concrete mixer With natural sand. Spec. No.: BdF.8 Page No. 302 and B.7, Page No.38	25054617.6
Providing & fixing precast reinforced cement concrete chajja (0.750mm around the building)(100mm thick)	622080	Providing & casting in situ cement concrete M-20 of trap' granite/ quartzite/ gneiss metal for R.C.C. chajja as per detailed design & drawings including centering, form work, cover blocks compacting & roughening the surface if special finish is to be provided & curing complete. (Excluding reinforcement). With fully automatic micro processor based PLC with SCADA enabled reversible drum type concrete mixer With natural sand (0.750mm around the building)(100mm thick)	1449619.2
Providing second class Burnt Brick masonry + Precast Wall costruction in even are as	186331296	Providing second class Burnt Brick masonry with conventional/ I.S. type bricks in cement mortar 1:6 in superstructure including striking joints, racking out joints, watering and scaffolding Complete	15386717
Providing and fixing Ghana teak wood double or single leaf second class fully paneled door shutter with 35mm thick style and rail with 25 mm thick panels with openable fan light as per detailed drawings. excluding the door frame 60mm x 100mm stainless steel fixtures and fastering and finishing the wood work with oil painting 3 coats. Spec. No.: Bd-T-7 & 8 Page No. 481-82	3077550	Providing and fixing Ghana teak wood double or single leaf second class fully paneled door shutter with 35mm thick style and rail with 25mm thick panels with openable fan light as per detailed drawings. excluding the door frame 60mm x 100mm stainless steel fixtures and fastening and finishing the wood work with oil painting 3 coats. Spec. No.: Bd-T-7 & 8 Page No. 481-82	3077550

Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017

www.ijarse.com



(L)

Providing and fixing frame with / without ventilator of size as specified with non teak wood for doors including chamfering, rounding, rebating, iron holdfast of size 300mm x 40mm x 5mm with oil painting, etc. complete. Spec. No.: As directed by Engineer in charge.	6096480	Providing and fixing frame with / without ventilator of size as specified with non teak wood for doors including chamfering, rounding, rebating, iron holdfast of size 300mm x 40mm x 5mm with oil painting, etc. complete. Spec. No.: As directed by Engineer in charge.	6096480
Providing and fixing Ghana teak wood double or single leaf second class fully paneled door shutter with 35mm thick style and rail with 25 mm thick panels with openable fan light as per detailed drawings. excluding the door frame 60mm x 100mm stainless steel fixtures and fastening and finishing the wood work with oil painting 3 coats. Spec. No.: Bd-T-7 & 8 P age No. 481-82.	310 5000	Providing and fixing Ghana teak wood double or single leaf second class fully paneled door shutter with 35mm thick style and rail with 25mm thick panels with openable fan light as per detailed drawings. excluding the door frame 60mmx 100mm stainless steel fixtures and fastening and finishing the wood work with oil painting 3 coats. Spec. No.: Bd-T-7 & 8 Page No. 481-82.	3105000
Providing and fixing window frame with / without ventilator of size as specified with non teak wood for doors including chamfering, rounding, rebating, iron holdfast of size 300mm x 40mm x 5mm with oil painting, etc. complete. Spec. No.: As directed by Engineer in charge(1.8 X2.3 M Opening asumed)	590400	Providing and fixing window frame with / without ventilator of size as specified with non teak wood for doors including chamfering, rounding, rebating, iron holdfast of size 300mm x 40mmx 5mm with oil painting, etc. complete. Spec. No.: As directed by Engineer in charge(1.8 X2.3 M Opening asumed)	590400
Providing and laying Polished Tandur Stone flooring 25mm to 30mm thick required width in plain/ diamond pattern on a bed of 1:6 C.M. including cement float, filling joints with neat cement slurry, curing, polishing and cleaning complete. Spec. No.: Bd.M.3 Page No. 380	14552525	Providing and laying Polished Tandur Stone flooring 25mm to 30mm thick required width in plain/diamond pattern on a bed of 1:6 C.M. including cement float, filling joints with neat cement slurry, curing, polishing and clearing complete. Spec. No.: Bd.M.3 Page No. 380	14552524.8
Providing & Laying Precast RCC Stair For structure. 1.5m landing	120268.8	Providing & Laying Precast RCC Stair For structure. 1.5m landing	236930
External Plastering (Not Necessary for precast)	Nil	Providing rough cast cement plaster externally in two coats to concrete, brick or stone masonry surfaces in all positions with base coat of 12 to 15 mm thick in C.M. 1:4 and rough cast treatment 12mm thick in proportion 1:1 1/2:3 including scaffolding and fourteen days curing complete.	2903040
	82158929		104580330
Add 5 % for Plumbing, Electrification & water charges	4107946		4980015
	86266875		104580330.34

We have work out the cost of both the buildings (RCC &Precast), From this analysis & calculations it can be said that the precast concrete system is economical than conventional cast in place method, the cost difference is found to be around 1.83 cr. but still there are some conditions which we have to take care of while using precast,

International Journal of Advance Research in Science and Engineering Vol. No.6, Issue No. 04, April 2017 www.ijarse.com

IJARSE ISSN (O) 2319 - 8354 ISSN (P) 2319 - 8346

those are quantity of construction, Distance of site from manufacturing unit. Type of building etc. we have identified that for standard & Repetitive work precast is the best option to choose. The main limitation of precast is transportation from place of manufacturing to place of site where it is to be fixed.

V. CONCLUSION

As we have seen various methods of precast, Design, case studies of precast & it is found that, the design comes out as economical if proper care while designing is taken. We have design the same building by traditional & precast method & Notice the Cost & completion duration It is remarkably seen that the cost of precast building is significantly reduces & duration of construction is also much lesser than traditional method. From all this study we can be conclude that the precast concrete system is economical than conventional cast in place method but still there are some conditions which we have to take care of while using precast, those are quantity of construction, Distance of site from manufacturing unit. Type of building etc. we have identified that for standard & Repetitive work precast is the best option to choose. In observation the most important thing is to be observed project is in precast construction technique is the time effective it require less time to construct. It requires skilled worker and qualified contractor, Lower initial cost especially for large project. We can achieve better concrete quality control and lighter concrete unite. The main limitation of precast is transportation from place of manufacturing to place of site where it is to be fixed.

REFERENCES

- [1.] www.ijmer.com Vol. 3, Issue. 3, May.-June. 2013 pp-1727-1730 ISSN: 2249-6645 by Vakas K. Rahman1, Prof. A. R. Mundhada2 (IJMER) – "Comparative Study of RCC and Prestressed Concrete Flat slab".
- [2.] Volume: 03 Issue: 06 | June-2016 www.irjet.net p-ISSN: 2395-0072 by Akash Lanke, Dr. D. Venkateswarlu "Design, Cost & Time analysis of Precast & RCC building"
- [3.] (AJER) e-ISSN : 2320-0847 p-ISSN : 2320-0936 Volume-02, Issue-12, pp-258-264 <u>www.ajer.org</u> by Mohammad Adil Dar1, Prof (Dr) A.R. Dar2, Asim Qureshi 3 ,Jayalakshmi Raju4 – "A Study on Earthquake Resistant Construction Techniques."
- [4.] <u>www.ijera.com</u> Vol. 3, Issue 5, Sep-Oct 2013, pp.540-546 by Mohommed Anwaruddin Md. Akberuddin*, Mohd. Zameeruddin Mohd. Saleemuddin – "Pushover Analysis of Medium Rise Multi-Story RCC Frame With and Without Vertical Irregularity.